

Editing Report

To: Clare Neller
From: Lisa Shaw
Date: 4/26/2007
Re: Editing Report on *Types of Guys*

Here are my comments about your draft that we workshopped during the last class period. I'll return a marked up copy of the draft to you on Tuesday to accompany this memo.

Purpose

The purpose of this memo is to give thoughtful feedback and information on the process of editing and ideas that were developed in your personal narrative paper in our writing for publication course (WRA 355). I chose to do both query editing and a light edit on your work to keep it original to your style. The changes that were made were to help me understand specific things better and with more clarity.

Editing Decisions

Since our last workshop, I was able to look over your piece and reflect on some things. I also made some grammar and style suggestions, which you will find below, and also marked on your paper.

Verb Tense

I like that you use present tense to describe all of the guys. It's appropriate and very readable. Nice job keeping in consistent.

Title

At this point in the drafting process, your piece remains untitled – but I don't think this is a problem. Sometimes the best titles are worked out only after the paper has been written and the conclusion solidified. I think that a humorous title would work for this piece, because the categorizations, while based on actual events, are mostly in jest.

Argument/Point

The argument/point is hinted at in the intro paragraph, which is nice. After reading it, I took away two major themes: 1) the lines drawn to categorize guys are fuzzy and provisional – in other words, my Funny Guy might be another girl's Pedestal; 2) the more overarching theme: even if nothing good comes out of a relationship, treat it as a life lesson and move on, learning what you do and don't want from the opposite sex.

Conclusion

While the sections of the each different category of guys is written with a very regimented format (listing of name, physical description, personality traits, etc), I think it would be interesting to take the final paragraph

away from this style, which you start off doing in this draft. This could be rather challenging though, and might not come with much success. Another idea for The Pedestal would be to keep the structure but play into it. For example, for the name, make up something funny, like Toby D. Terminned (said aloud it reads like “to be determined” ...okay, that’s lame, but you know what I mean. Or leave question marks?). Maybe make up some quirky details ... show that he’s a combination of all the former types of guys.

Intended Audience

A possible audience for this piece might be a women’s magazine, or maybe a column piece. It would also be funny to submit this to a website like wikipedia, as a cultural commentary on the definitions and categories of guys/people in general.

Detail/Sensory Imagery

The details and images in this paper are excellent. The reader really gets a feel for all the different types of guys, and the descriptions are key to triggering memories and thoughts about other people that are personal to the reader who also fall under these subheads.

Images that I particularly liked:

“A country boy, he enjoys the outdoors and never turns down a dare.”

“His eyes are almost black, the kind that scare you because you can’t see a pupil, your reflection, or whether they are telling a lie or not.”

“The smell of marijuana usually lingers on his clothes, and at one point you just mistake that smell for his cologne.”

Introduction

The intro serves as a nice set up to the piece. It’s simple and concise, laying out what’s to come. Aside from a few technical and stylistic issues (see the Queries section below), it does a nice job and serves its purpose well.

Queries, Insight, and Suggestions

The queries are in order of the paper and the marks I made:

Intro paragraph

- The dashes in the very first sentence tripped me up. From reading the rest of your paper, I know that you’re going for a conversational tone, and I think the use of em dashes are meant to reflect this pause in speech; however, I think it might read easier with different punctuation, or rewording. A possibility: “Girls talk about boys – a lot.”
- In the second sentence, the word “experience” should be plural, to read: “...the life experiences and lessons...”
- Also in the second sentence, there’s three uses of “have” very close together ... just flagging the word repetition
- While the intro reads quickly, the last sentence slows things down quite a bit, just because of the wording. I’ve highlighted the part of the sentence that I found particularly hard to glance through while going over the paper

The player

- When referencing the shoes, the word “Jordans” doesn’t need an apostrophe
- Towards the middle of the paragraph there is an unnecessary word... in the sentence that begins “He is smooth...”, the second “is” can be deleted
- Towards the end of the paragraph, I made some suggestions with regards to comma usage and marked them on the paper
- Suggestion to add a word in the third to last sentence, so it reads: “At some point, **though**, you cant ignore the truth...” just to keep with the conversational tone

The nice guy

- Towards the middle of the paragraph: Valentine’s Day needs an apostrophe ... also, I suggested a comma after the word “Day”

- You use the phrase “you just can’t bring yourself to it.” Colloquially, this phrase usually has the word “do” in it, to read: “you just can’t bring yourself to **do** it.”

The jock

- In the third line, you change verb tenses and use “was” probably will want to change that to “is” for consistency purposes
- I love the comment that you throw in towards the middle: “those turn you on, don’t lie.” However, I would almost expect to see this comment in parentheses, as I think it is meant as an aside comment ... this is a choice of preference
- Some word/phrase repetition you might want to watch out for towards the end of the paragraph: “attractive” and “push themselves”

The pot head

- The main thing I flagged in this paragraph was word repetition: “conversation” and variations of the word “mean”
- I love the last sentence: “You just want to dance to the freaking music.”

The poser

- I’ve highlighted the first sentence in this paragraph, because I felt this was another instance where you were trying to capture the conversational tone that you keep so well throughout the piece. For some reason, reading this aloud sounded strange to me; but it entirely depends on what you’re going for and how you want it read. My personal suggestion: “Ahh, the poser Tim” or “Ahh, the poser, Tim” – this one is completely a preference call
- Because the phrase “soon to be” is used as a modifier, it should be hyphenated: “soon-to-be”

The funny guy

- Delete the “a” in the second sentence ... reads: “kind of scrubby” instead of “kind of a scrubby”
- I love this sentence: “But after awhile, the riddler wriggles his way into your heart.”
- Delete “to” in the last sentence

The looker

- Unneeded comma in the third sentence

General comments

- The heading titles need a consistent format with regards to capitalization; some are capitalized, others are lower cased
- Also dealing with the titles ... in some paragraphs, you refer to other categories by just saying “the jock” or “the funny guy” ... in other places, you capitalize the title, saying “The Player” ... and other places, the titles are between single quotations: “The Looker” “ ... whichever way you want to make these references, just make sure it is consistent throughout
- In our workshop, one of the suggestions was to reorganize the categories to that they show more of a contrast. I would also suggest that the two paragraphs that make a lot of references (The Nice Guy and The Poser) come near the end, because as I was reading your paper, I felt like each type of guy was a new character, and I would prefer the character description before the references

Final Thoughts

I enjoyed reading this piece, and I feel like it’s very relatable, to both sexes. It’s lighthearted but also very accurate, and I think that’s why it works without being offensive. The voice that you use is great and very appropriate. Although this draft requires a little tweaking, it’s coming along very nicely. I can’t wait to see the final product.

If you have any questions about my editing marks or suggestions, please feel free to ask. I hope that this document helps you in your revisions.